

## COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF SOME ASPECTS OF PRACTICE AND STANDARDS IN DOCTORAL STUDIES IN THE REGION

**Commented [LN1]:** This document came into being largely by the cutesy of the University of Montenegro team

This analysis covers three aspects of doctoral studies: supervision/mentoring, students' enrolment and assessment process

### SUPERVISION/MENTORING

University	Required Field	Required academic position	Whether professor emeritus can be supervisor/mentor or	Minimum scientific competence	Maximal allowed number of doctoral students	Co-supervising /co-mentoring	Special prerequisites for mentoring required by university units
Belgrade	Sciences (Mathematics, Natural Sciences, Medicine, Engineering and Technology)			5 articles in SCI journals in the last 10 years	5		
	Humanities and Social Sciences			3 articles in SCI journals in the last 10 years	5		
Novi Sad	Sciences (Mathematics, Natural Sciences, Medicine, Engineering and Technology)	Assistant Professor or Associated Professor or Full Professor	-	5 articles in SCI journals in the last 10 years	5	It is allowed	

	Humanities and Social Sciences	Assistant Professor or Associated Professor or Full Professor	-	3 articles in SCI journals in the last 10 years	5	It is allowed	
	Art	Assistant Professor or Associated Professor or Full Professor	-	3 representative references in the last 10 years	5	It is allowed	
Niš	Sciences (Mathematics, Natural Sciences, Medicine, Engineering and Technology)			5 articles in SCI journals	5		
	Humanities and Social Sciences			24 points	5		
	Architecture			24 points	5		
	Art			Doctor of Art or Full Professor of the related art fields	5		

**Commented [R2]:**

At least 24 points covering publications in various categories of journals including those in SCI, ERIH, HEINONLINE i ECOLIBRI lists.

**Commented [R3]:**

At least 24 points covering publications in various categories of journals including 10 points for the articles in SCI journals.

Podgorica	Sciences (Mathematics, Natural Sciences, Medicine, Engineering and Technology)	Associated Professor or Full Professor	-	5 articles in SCI journals	3	It is allowed with appropriate justification in case of interdisciplinary studies	
	Humanities and Social Sciences	Associated Professor or Full Professor	-	3 articles in SCI or A&HCI journals	3	It is allowed	
	Art	Associated Professor or Full Professor	-	5 representative references	3	It is allowed	
Zagreb		Assistant Professor or Associated Professor or Full Professor	With appropriate justification	Coordination or participation in scientific projects, with recognition in international scientific or artistic community, and publications or relevant artistic references in the field of doctoral thesis in last 5 years	Defined by the related university unit	Allowed with appropriate justification for example in case of interdisciplinary studies or conduction of research activities in several higher education / research institutions	For junior supervisors - attendance at the training workshop

Rijeka		Academic involved on postgraduate studies or reputable expert not necessarily from academia	-	At least 2 articles in CC, SCI or SCIE journals in last 5 years.	-	Allowed if faculty council find it useful for doctoral student, in case when supervisor is not member of the faculty	
Split	Medicine	Assistant Professor or Associated Professor or Full Professor	It is allowed	At least 3 articles in SCI or WoS journals in last 5 years	-		
Zadar				Participation in at least one international scientific conference in last 5 years, at least 3 publications relevant for academic promotion in the related field		It is allowed for external supervisors	
East Sarajevo		Assistant Professor or Associated Professor or Full Professor	-	At least 1 articles in SSC, AHC or WOS journals	3	It is allowed for external supervisors	

**Commented [LN4]:** 3 articles starting with 2019/20 school year.

Sarajevo		Associated Professor or Full Professor	It is allowed			It is allowed for interdisciplinary theme. In Arts, two supervisors are obligatory (one for artistic project and another one for the PhD thesis).	
Banja Luka		Associated Professor or Full Professor	Not allowed to act as supervisor	At least 2 articles in SCI,CC, etc. journals	Defined by the related university unit	Allowed with appropriate justification	
Ljubljana		teaching or research position at university	-	100 SICRISS points in last 5 (Except Faculty of Mechanical Engineering which requires 200 SICRISS points and Faculty of Economy which requires 5 papers in journals with peer review in last 5 years, providing that at least one is published in a journal included in SSCI or SCI or ABS or EBR list.	5 (no restrictions for the co-mentoring)	It is allowed with appropriate justification for interdisciplinary fields	
Skopje		teaching or research position at university		teaching or research position at university		It is allowed	

	Art, Philosophy, History			20 points in last 5 years including minimum 9 points for scientific results and 3 points for participation in scientific projects			
Bitola		Associated Professor or Full Professor		At least 5 articles in last 5 years in journals with international board and participation on at least 3 international conferences in last 4 years	3		
Prishtina	Sciences (Mathematics, Natural Sciences, Medicine, Engineering and Technology)	Associated Professor or Full Professor	-	At least 5 articles in last 5 years published in international journals	2	It is allowed for inter disciplinary studies with appropriate justification	
	Humanities and Social Sciences	Associated Professor or Full Professor	-	At least 5 articles in last 5 years published in int. journals	2	It is allowed	

Tirana	Sciences (Mathematics, Natural Sciences, Medicine, Engineering and Technology)	Associated Professor or Full Professor				It is allowed for inter disciplinary studies with appropriate justification	
	Humanities and Social Sciences					It is allowed	
University	Required Field	Required academic position	Whether professor emeritus can be supervisor	Scientific competence	Maximal number of doctoral students	Co-supervising	Prerequisites

**Commented [LN5]:** Data provided by the courtesy of the University of Prishtina

## STUDENTS ENROLLMENT

University	Number of required ECTS	Prerequisites for enrolment	Good commend of a foreign language	Doctoral admission requirements	Additional prerequisites
Belgrade	300 360 (Medicine)		Yes, one foreign language	An average mark achieved on the previous studies, results obtained at the entry tests and interviews concerning abilities and inclinations	
Novi Sad	300	An average mark of at least 8 (in the scale from 6 to 10) on bachelor and master studies	-	An average mark of at achieved on bachelor and master studies	
Niš	300	An average mark of at least 8 (in the scale from 6 to 10) on master studies		An average mark and duration of previous studies (bachelor and master), and published scientific results (if any)	
Podgorica	300	No specific prerequisites	Yes, one foreign language	An average mark achieved on the previous studies	
Zagreb	300	No specific prerequisites	-	An average mark achieved on the previous studies and recommendations	Interview with the candidate and decision whether would be full time or part time



Rijeka	300	No specific prerequisites	-	An average score taking into account achievements of the previous studies (30%), published scientific papers (20%), students awards (15%), recommendations (25%), interview (10%)	Decision on the model of studies (full time or part time)
Split				Doctoral admission requirements set up by the University Council	
Zadar				An average mark achieved on the previous studies and recommendation obtained from at least one professor (additional enrollment requirements are set up in a specific document)	
East Sarajevo	300	An average mark of at least 8 (in the scale from 6 to 10) on bachelor and master studies.  For enrollment at the Academy of Arts (Fine Arts and Music) an average mark of at least	One foreign language	An average mark of at least 8 (in the scale from 6 to 10) on bachelor and master studies multiplied by total number of ECTS and divided by the total number of semesters in both cycles.	University units could prescribe additional criteria including entry test.

**Commented [LN6]:** According to the rules of conduct issued in 2006, under some specific circumstances Council of Doctoral Studies could allow enrollment without prior degree (e.g. in case of extremely talented persons)

		9 (in the scale from 6 to 10) on master, mark 10 obtained on the principal subject at bachelor level and entry test passed.			
Sarajevo	???			In case when number of enrolled students is greater than projected number, selection/ranking procedure takes into account results achieved in the second cycle of studies and scientific/artistic contributions, if necessary.	
Banja Luka	300	No specific prerequisites	No specific requirements; each University units could prescribe its own prerequisites according to internal rules.	An average mark obtained in first and second cycle, duration of previous studies and scientific achievements.	University units could prescribe additional criteria.
Ljubljana	300				Decision on the model of studies (full time or part time)
Skopje	300	An average mark of at least 8 (in the scale from 6 to 10) on master studies	One foreign language		

**Commented [R7]:** Students having "magistar" degree, obtained before B&H joined Bologna process, 60ECTS are granted by default.

**Commented [R8]:** Students having "magistar" degree, obtained before Macedonia joined Bologna process, 60ECTS are granted by default.

Bitola	300				
Kosovska Mitrovica	300	An average mark of at least 8 (in the scale from 6 to 10) on master studies	-	An average mark and duration of studies on the previous two cycles and achieved scientific results.	
Prishtina	300	An average mark of at least 8 (in the scale from 6 to 10) on master studies	One foreign language	An average mark and duration of studies on the previous cycle along with recommendations.	Interview with the candidate and decision on the model of studies (full time or part time).
University	Number of required ECTS	Prerequisites for enrolment	Good commend of a foreign language	Enrolment Ranking	Additional prerequisites

**Commented [R9]:** Students having "magistar" degree, obtained before Macedonia joined Bologna process, 60ECTS are granted by default.

#### ASESMENT COMMITTEE AND PREREQUISITES FOR ORAL EXAMINATION

University	Number of committee members	The fields of expertise of the committee members	External examiners could participate in the assessment committee	Whether supervisor can be involved in the assessment process	Departments/faculties requiring publication in SCI journals or equivalent as a prerequisites for oral examination
Belgrade	Min 3, Max 5 members	All are required to have expertise in the field as PhD thesis	It is not forbidden	Not clear	
Novi Sad	Min 3 members	All are required to have expertise in the field as PhD thesis	Min 1 external is required	Could be	
Niš	3 to 5 members	All are required to have expertise in the field as PhD thesis	Min 1 external is required	As a rule	
Podgorica	Min 3 members	All are required to have expertise in the field as PhD thesis	Min 1 external is required	It is mandatory	
Zagreb	Min 3 members	All are required to have expertise in the field as PhD thesis	Min 1 external is required	Not allowed	
Rijeka	Odd number of members	All are required to have expertise in the field as PhD thesis	Min 1 external is required	Could be a member but cannot be charring	

Split	3 members as a rule plus one spare; In case when PhD theme involves at least three scientific fields 5 members are required		One external as a rule	Not allowed	
Zadar	Min 3 members providing that total number is odd	All are required to have expertise in the field as PhD thesis	Min 1 external is required	Could be	
East Sarajevo	Min 3 or 5 members	All are required to have expertise in the field as PhD thesis		Could be	
Sarajevo	3 to 5 members	All are required to have expertise in the field as PhD thesis			
Banja Luka	Min 3 members	All are required to have expertise in the field as PhD thesis	Min 1 external is required	Could be a member of the committee but cannot be chairing	
Ljubljana		All are required to have expertise in the field as PhD thesis	Min 1 external is required	Supervisor and co-supervisor do not take part in assessment process but they can be present at the oral examination	
Skopje	5 members	Min. 3 members of the committee to have expertise in the field as PhD thesis	-	Could be a member of the committee but cannot be chairing	

**Commented [R10]:**

At least one member of the Assessment committee have to be affiliated at some other university and at least one member of the Assessment committee have to have full professorship.

**Commented [LN11]:** The participation of the supervisor in the assessment committee use to be forbidden before 2013

Bitola	5 members (associated or full professors only)		1 external is required	Cannot be a member of assessment committee	
Kosovska Mitrovica	Min 3 members	All are required to have expertise in the field as PhD thesis	Min. 1	Could be a member of the committee but cannot be charring	
Prishtina	Min 3 members	All are required to have expertise in the field as PhD thesis	Min. 1	Cannot be a member of assessment committee	
Tirana					
University	Number of committee members	Fields of the committee members	External examiners could participate in the assessment committee	Whether supervisor can be involved in the assessment process	Departments/faculties requiring publication in SCI journals or equivalent as a prerequisites for oral examination